

Methodological notes

Transition indicators

The transition indicator scores in Chapter 1 reflect the judgment of the EBRD's Office of the Chief Economist about country-specific progress in transition. The scores are based on the following classification system, which was originally developed in the 1994 *Transition Report*, but has been refined and amended in subsequent Reports.

"+" and "-" ratings are treated by adding 0.33 and subtracting 0.33 from the full value. The average is obtained by rounding down, e.g. a score of 2.6 is treated as 2+, but a score of 2.8 is treated as 3-.

Overall transition indicators

Large-scale privatisation

- 1 Little private ownership.
- 2 Comprehensive scheme almost ready for implementation; some sales completed.
- 3 More than 25 per cent of large-scale enterprise assets in private hands or in the process of being privatised (with the process having reached a stage at which the state has effectively ceded its ownership rights), but possibly with major unresolved issues regarding corporate governance.
- 4 More than 50 per cent of state-owned enterprise and farm assets in private ownership and significant progress on corporate governance of these enterprises.
- 4+ Standards and performance typical of advanced industrial economies: more than 75 per cent of enterprise assets in private ownership with effective corporate governance.

Small-scale privatisation

- 1 Little progress.
- 2 Substantial share privatised.
- 3 Comprehensive programme almost ready for implementation.

- 4 Complete privatisation of small companies with tradable ownership rights.
- 4+ Standards and performance typical of advanced industrial economies: no state ownership of small enterprises; effective tradability of land.

Governance and enterprise restructuring

- 1 Soft budget constraints (lax credit and subsidy policies weakening financial discipline at the enterprise level); few other reforms to promote corporate governance.
- 2 Moderately tight credit and subsidy policy, but weak enforcement of bankruptcy legislation and little action taken to strengthen competition and corporate governance.
- 3 Significant and sustained actions to harden budget constraints and to promote corporate governance effectively (for example, privatisation combined with tight credit and subsidy policies and/or enforcement of bankruptcy legislation).
- 4 Substantial improvement in corporate governance and significant new investment at the enterprise level.
- 4+ Standards and performance typical of advanced industrial economies: effective corporate control exercised through domestic financial institutions and markets, fostering market-driven restructuring.

Price liberalisation

- 1 Most prices formally controlled by the government.
- 2 Some lifting of price administration; state procurement at non-market prices for the majority of product categories.
- 3 Significant progress on price liberalisation, but state procurement at non-market prices remains substantial.
- 4 Comprehensive price liberalisation; state procurement at non-market prices largely phased out; only a small number of administered prices remain.
- 4+ Standards and performance typical of advanced industrial economies: complete price liberalisation with no price control outside housing, transport and natural monopolies.

Trade and foreign exchange system

- 1 Widespread import and/or export controls or very limited legitimate access to foreign exchange.
- 2 Some liberalisation of import and/or export controls; almost full current account convertibility in principle, but with a foreign exchange regime that is not fully transparent (possibly with multiple exchange rates).
- 3 Removal of almost all quantitative and administrative import and export restrictions; almost full current account convertibility.
- 4 Removal of all quantitative and administrative import and export restrictions (apart from agriculture) and all significant export tariffs; insignificant direct involvement in exports and imports by ministries and state-owned trading companies; no major non-uniformity of customs duties for non-agricultural goods and services; full and current account convertibility.
- 4+ Standards and performance norms of advanced industrial economies: removal of most tariff barriers; membership in WTO.

Competition policy

- 1 No competition legislation and institutions.
- 2 Competition policy legislation and institutions set up; some reduction of entry restrictions or enforcement action on dominant firms.
- 3 Some enforcement actions to reduce abuse of market power and to promote a competitive environment, including break-ups of dominant conglomerates; substantial reduction of entry restrictions.
- 4 Significant enforcement actions to reduce abuse of market power and to promote a competitive environment.
- 4+ Standards and performance typical of advanced industrial economies: effective enforcement of competition policy; unrestricted entry to most markets.

Banking reform and interest rate liberalisation

- 1 Little progress beyond establishment of a two-tier system.
- 2 Significant liberalisation of interest rates and credit allocation; limited use of directed credit or interest rate ceilings.
- 3 Substantial progress in establishment of bank solvency and of a framework for prudential supervision and regulation; full interest rate liberalisation with little preferential access to cheap refinancing; significant lending to private enterprises and significant presence of private banks.
- 4 Significant movement of banking laws and regulations towards BIS standards; well-functioning banking competition and effective prudential supervision; significant term lending to private enterprises; substantial financial deepening.
- 4+ Standards and performance norms of advanced industrial economies: full convergence of banking laws and regulations with BIS standards; provision of full set of competitive banking services.

Securities markets and non-bank financial institutions

- 1 Little progress.
- 2 Formation of securities exchanges, market-makers and brokers; some trading in government paper and/or securities; rudimentary legal and regulatory framework for the issuance and trading of securities.
- 3 Substantial issuance of securities by private enterprises; establishment of independent share registries, secure clearance and settlement procedures, and some protection of minority shareholders; emergence of non-bank financial institutions (for example, investment funds, private insurance and pension funds, leasing companies) and associated regulatory framework.
- 4 Securities laws and regulations approaching IOSCO standards; substantial market liquidity and capitalisation; well-functioning non-bank financial institutions and effective regulation.
- 4+ Standards and performance norms of advanced industrial economies: full convergence of securities laws and regulations with IOSCO standards; fully developed non-bank intermediation.

Infrastructure reform

The ratings are calculated as the average of five infrastructure reform indicators covering electric power, roads, railways, telecommunications, water and waste water. The classification system used for these five indicators is detailed below.

Infrastructure transition indicators

Electric power

- 1 Power sector operates as government department with few commercial freedoms or pressures. Average prices well below costs, with extensive cross-subsidies. Monolithic structure, with no separation of different parts of the business.
- 2 Power company distanced from government, but there is still political interference. Some attempt to harden budget constraints, but effective tariffs are low. Weak management incentives for efficient performance. Little institutional reform and minimal, if any, private sector involvement.
- 3 Law passed providing for full-scale restructuring of industry, including vertical unbundling through account separation and set-up of regulator. Some tariff reform and improvements in revenue collection. Some private sector involvement.
- 4 Separation of generation, transmission and distribution. Independent regulator set up. Rules for cost-reflective tariff-setting formulated and implemented. Substantial private sector involvement in distribution and/or generation. Some degree of liberalisation.
- 4+ Tariffs cost-reflective and provide adequate incentives for efficiency improvements. Large-scale private sector involvement in the unbundled and well-regulated sector. Fully liberalised sector with well-functioning arrangements for network access and full competition in generation.

Railways

- 1 Monolithic structure operated as government department, with few commercial freedoms. No private sector involvement and extensive cross-subsidisation.
- 2 Rail operations distanced from state, but weak commercial objectives. Some business planning, but targets are general and tentative. No budgetary funding of public service obligations. Ancillary businesses separated, but little divestment. Minimal private sector involvement.
- 3 Commercial orientation in rail operations. Freight and passenger services separated and some ancillary businesses divested. Some budgetary compensation available for passenger services. Improved business planning with clear investment and rehabilitation targets, but funding unsecured. Some private sector involvement in rehabilitation and/or maintenance.
- 4 Railways fully commercialised, with separate internal profit centres for passenger and freight. Extensive market freedoms to set tariffs and investments. Implementation of medium-term business plans. Ancillary industries divested. Private sector participation in freight operation, ancillary services and track maintenance.
- 4+ Separation of infrastructure from operations and freight from passenger operations. Full divestment and transfer of asset ownership implemented or planned, including infrastructure and rolling stock. Rail regulator established and access pricing implemented.

Roads

- 1 Minimal degree of decentralisation and no commercialisation. All regulatory, road management and resource allocation functions centralised at ministerial level. New investments and road maintenance financing dependent on central budget allocations. Road user charges not based on the cost of road use. Road construction and maintenance undertaken by public construction units. No public consultation in the preparation of road projects.
- 2 Moderate degree of decentralisation and initial steps in commercialisation. Road/highway agency created. Improvements in resource allocation and public procurement. Road user charges based on vehicle and fuel taxes, but not linked to road use. Road fund established, but dependent on central budget. Road construction and maintenance undertaken primarily by corporatised public entities, with some private sector participation. Minimal public consultation/participation on road projects.
- 3 Fair degree of decentralisation and commercialisation. Regulation and resource allocation functions separated from road maintenance and operations. Level of vehicle and fuel taxes related to road use. Private companies able to provide and operate roads under negotiated commercial contracts. Private sector participation in road maintenance and/or through concessions to finance, operate and maintain parts of highway network. Limited public consultation/participation and accountability on road projects.
- 4 Large degree of decentralisation. Transparent methodology used to allocate road expenditures. Track record in competitive procurement for road design, construction, maintenance and operations. Large-scale private sector participation in construction, operations and maintenance directly and through public-private partnerships. Substantial public consultation/participation and accountability on road projects.
- 4+ Fully decentralised road administration. Commercialised road maintenance operations competitively awarded to private companies. Road user charges reflect the full costs of road use and associated factors, such as congestion, accidents and pollution. Widespread private sector participation in all aspects of road provision. Full public consultation on new road projects.

Telecommunications

- 1 Little progress in commercialisation and regulation. Minimal private sector involvement and strong political interference in management decisions. Low tariffs, with extensive cross-subsidisation. Liberalisation not envisaged, even for mobile telephony and value-added services.
- 2 Modest progress in commercialisation. Corporatisation of dominant operator and some separation from public sector governance, but tariffs are still politically set.
- 3 Substantial progress in commercialisation and regulation. Telecommunications and postal services fully separated, and cross-subsidies reduced. Considerable liberalisation in the mobile segment and in value-added services.
- 4 Complete commercialisation, including privatisation of the dominant operator, and comprehensive regulatory and institutional reforms. Extensive liberalisation of entry.
- 4+ Effective regulation through an independent entity. Coherent regulatory and institutional framework to deal with tariffs, interconnection rules, licensing, concession fees and spectrum allocation. Consumer ombudsman function.

Water and waste water

- 1 Minimal degree of decentralisation; no commercialisation. Services operated as vertically integrated natural monopolies by a government ministry or municipal departments. No financial autonomy and/or management capacity at municipal level. Low tariffs, low cash collection rates and high cross-subsidies.
- 2 Moderate degree of decentralisation; initial steps towards commercialisation. Services provided by municipally owned companies. Partial cost recovery through tariffs, and initial steps to reduce cross-subsidies. General public guidelines exist regarding tariff-setting and service quality but both under ministerial control. Some private sector participation through service or management contacts, or competition to provide ancillary services.
- 3 Fair degree of decentralisation and commercialisation. Water utilities operate with managerial and accounting independence from municipalities, using international accounting standards and management information systems. Operating costs recovered through tariffs, with a minimum level of cross-subsidies. More detailed rules drawn up in contract documents, specifying tariff review formulae and performance standards. Private sector participation through the full concession of a major service in at least one city.
- 4 Large degree of decentralisation and commercialisation. Water utilities managerially independent, with cash flows – net of municipal budget transfers – that ensure financial viability. No cross-subsidies. Semi-autonomous regulatory agency has power to advise and enforce tariffs and service quality. Substantial private sector participation through build-operator-transfer concessions, management contacts or asset sales in several cities.
- 4+ Water utilities fully decentralised and commercialised. Fully autonomous regulator exists with complete authority to review and enforce tariff levels and quality standards. Widespread private sector participation via service/ management/lease contracts. High-powered incentives, full concessions and/or divestiture of water and waste-water services in major urban areas.

Definitions and data sources for structural indicators box

Liberalisation

Current account convertibility

Options: full (full compliance with Article VIII of IMF Agreement); limited (restrictions on payments or transfers for current account transactions).

Source: *International Monetary Fund, Annual report on exchange arrangements and exchange restrictions.*

Interest rate liberalisation

Options: full (banks free to set deposit and lending rates); limited de facto (no legal restrictions on banks to set deposit and lending rates, but limitations arise from substantial market distortions, such as directed credits or poorly functioning or high illiquid money or credit markets); limited de jure (restrictions on the setting of interest rates by banks through law, decree or central bank regulation).

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Wage regulation

Restrictions or substantial taxes on the ability of some enterprises to adjust the average wage or wage bill upward. Options: yes; no.

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Stabilisation

Share of general government tax revenue in GDP

General government includes central government, extra-budgetary funds and local government.

Source: *See the macroeconomic indicators tables.*

Exchange rate regime

Options: currency board; fixed; fixed with band; crawling peg; crawling peg with band; managed float; floating.

Source: *International Monetary Fund, Annual report on exchange arrangements and exchange restrictions.*

Privatisation

Primary privatisation method since the start of transition

Options: vouchers (distribution of investment coupons at a symbolic price); direct sales (sales to outsiders); MEBOs (management/employee buy-outs); liquidations.

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Secondary privatisation method since the start of transition

Options and definitions as above.

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Tradability of land

Options: full (no substantial restrictions on the tradability of land rights beyond administrative requirements; no discrimination between domestic and foreign subjects); full except foreigners (as "full", but with some differential treatment of foreigners); limited de facto (substantial de facto limitations on the tradability of land, for example, the lack of enforceability of land rights, a non-existent land market, or significant obstruction by government officials); limited de jure (legal restrictions on the tradability of land rights); no (land trade prohibited).

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Enterprise and markets

Competition Office

Competition or anti-monopoly office exists separately from any ministry, though it may not be fully independent. Options: yes; no.

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Infrastructure

Independent telecommunications regulator

Independent body, but the scope of power may differ across countries. Options: yes; no.

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Separation of railway accounts

Accounts for freight and passenger operations separated. Options: yes; no.

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Independent electricity regulator

Independent body, but the scope of power may differ across countries. Options: yes; no.

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Financial sector

Capital adequacy ratio

Ratio of bank regulatory capital to risk-weighted assets; regulatory capital includes paid-in capital, retentions and some forms of subordinated debt.

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Deposit insurance system

Deposits in all banks covered by a formal deposit insurance scheme. Options: yes; no.

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Secured transactions law

Non-possessory security over movable assets permitted. Options: yes; restricted; no.

Source: *EBRD regional survey of secured transactions laws.*

Securities commission

Securities and exchange commission exists separately from any ministry, although it may not be fully independent. Options: yes; no.

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Social sector

Share of the population living in poverty

Percentage of population living on less than US\$ 2 (in 1985 US\$ at purchasing power parity) a day per person. Selected years 1995-99.

Source: *World Bank, World Development Indicators.*

Private pension funds

Options: yes; no.

Source: *EBRD staff assessments.*

Definitions and data sources for structural indicators table

Liberalisation

Share of administered prices in CPI (in per cent)

Administered prices are those prices subject to regulation by the state.

Sources: EBRD survey of national authorities and IMF country reports.

Number of goods with administered prices in EBRD-15 basket

EBRD-15 basket consists of flour/bread, meat, milk, gasoline/petrol, cotton textiles, shoes, paper, cars, television sets, cement, steel, coal, wood, rents, intercity bus service.

Source: EBRD survey of national authorities.

Share of trade with non-transition economies (in per cent)

Ratio of merchandise exports and imports with non-transition economies to total trade (exports plus imports).

Source: IMF, *Directions of Trade Statistics*.

Share of trade in GDP (in per cent)

Ratio of exports plus imports to GDP.

Source: See the macroeconomic indicators tables.

Tariff revenues (in per cent of imports)

Tariff revenues include all revenues from international trade. Imports are those of merchandise goods.

Sources: National authorities and IMF country reports.

Privatisation

Privatisation revenues (cumulative, in per cent of GDP)

Government revenues from cash sales of enterprises, not including investment commitments.

Sources: National authorities and IMF country reports.

Private sector share in GDP (in per cent)

“Private sector share” in GDP represent rough EBRD estimates, based on available statistics from both official (government) sources and unofficial sources. The underlying concept of private sector value added includes income generated by the activity of private registered companies, as well as by private entities engaged in informal activity in those cases where reliable information on informal activity is available.

Source: EBRD staff estimates.

Private sector share in employment (in per cent)

“Private sector share” in employment represent rough EBRD estimates, based on available statistics from both official (government) sources and unofficial sources. The underlying concept of private sector employment includes employment in private registered companies, as well as in private entities engaged in informal activity in those cases where reliable information on informal activity is available.

Source: EBRD staff estimates.

Enterprise and markets

Budgetary subsidies and current transfers (in per cent of GDP)

Budgetary transfers to enterprises and households, excluding social transfers.

Sources: National authorities and IMF country reports.

Share of industry in total employment (in per cent)

Industry includes electricity, power, manufacturing, mining and water.

Sources: ILO, *Labour Statistics Yearbook*, UN, *National Account Statistics*, national statistical publications and IMF country reports.

Change in labour productivity in industry (in per cent)

Labour productivity is calculated as the ratio of industrial production to industrial employment. Changes in productivity are calculated on the basis of annual averages.

Sources: National statistical publications and IMF country reports.

Investment rate/GDP (in per cent)

Gross domestic investment consists of additional outlays to the economy’s fixed assets, plus net changes in inventory levels. Fixed assets include: land improvements (fences, ditches, drains, etc.); plant, machinery and equipment purchases; and the construction of roads, railways, schools, offices, hospitals, private residential dwellings, commercial and industrial buildings etc. Inventories are stocks of goods held by firms to meet temporary or unexpected fluctuations in production or sales and “work in progress”. Net acquisitions of valuables are also considered capital formation.

Source: See the macroeconomic indicators tables.

Infrastructure

Fixed-line (mobile) penetration rate (per 100 inhabitants)

Fixed line refers to the number of telephone lines connecting a customer to the Public Switched Telephone Network (PSTN). Mobiles refer to the number of cellular mobile telephone subscribers.

Source: International Telecommunications Union.

Internet penetration rate (per 10,000 inhabitants)

Internet penetration rate is calculated as the number of Internet hosts (number of computers directly linked to the worldwide Internet network) per 10,000 inhabitants.

Source: International Telecommunications Union.

Railway labour productivity (1989=100)

Productivity measured as the ratio of the number of traffic units (passenger-kilometres plus freight tonne-kilometres) and the total number of railway employees.

Sources: National authorities and World Bank.

Residential electricity tariff, US cents per kilowatt-hour

Average tariff paid by residential consumers; where data on residential tariffs is not available, average retail tariff.

Sources: International Energy Agency, *Energy Regulators Association* and EBRD survey of national authorities.

Average collection rates, electricity (in per cent)

Collection rate is defined as the ratio of total electricity payments received in cash and total electricity charges.

Source: EBRD survey of national authorities.

GDP per unit of energy use (PPP in US dollars per kgoe)

The PPP GDP per kilogram of oil equivalent of commercial energy use. GDP is converted to international US dollars using purchasing power parity exchange rates.

Source: World Bank, *World Development Indicators*.

Financial sector

Number of banks (foreign-owned)

Number of commercial and savings banks, excluding cooperative banks. Foreign-owned banks are defined as those with foreign ownership exceeding a 50 per cent share, end-of-year.

Source: EBRD survey of central banks.

Asset share of state-owned banks (in per cent)

Share of total bank assets of majority state-owned banks in total bank sector assets. The state includes the federal, regional and municipal levels, as well as the state property fund and the state pension fund. State-owned banks are defined as banks with state ownership exceeding 50 per cent, end-of-year.

Source: EBRD survey of central banks.

Non-performing loans (in per cent of total loans)

Ratio of non-performing loans to total loans. Non-performing loans include sub-standard, doubtful and loss classification categories for loans, but excludes loans transferred to a state rehabilitation agency or consolidation bank, end-of-year.

Source: EBRD survey of central banks.

Domestic credit to private sector (in per cent of GDP)

Ratio of total outstanding bank credit to the private sector at end-of-year, including households and enterprises, to GDP.

Source: EBRD survey of central banks.

Stock market capitalisation (in per cent of GDP)

Market value of all shares listed on the stock market as a percentage of GDP, end-of-year.

Source: EBRD survey of national stock markets. In some cases, the data differ notably from capitalisation as reported by the Standard & Poor's/IFC Handbook of Emerging Markets. The difference is due to the exclusion in the Standard & Poor's/IFC data of companies listed on the third tier.

Social sector

Expenditures on health and education (in per cent of GDP)

Expenditures of general government, excluding those by state-owned enterprises.

Sources: Ministries of finance, IMF country reports, World Bank, World Development Indicators.

Life expectancy at birth, total (years)

Life expectancy is defined as the average age reached by an individual after the first day of life, excluding deaths at birth.

Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators.

Basic school enrolment ratio (in per cent)

Gross rates of school enrolment in per cent of the relevant population between 7 and 15 years old. Basic school includes eight years of schooling from the age of 7/8 to 14/15.

Sources: UNICEF, International Child Development Centre, TransMONEE Database.

Definitions and data sources for macroeconomic indicators table

Data represent official estimates of out-turns as reflected in publications from the national authorities, the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank and other sources. Data for the current year are EBRD staff estimates.

Output and expenditure

Official estimates of GDP, industrial and agricultural production. Growth rates can lack precision in the context of transition due to large shifts in relative prices, the failure to account for quality improvements and the substantial size and change in the informal sector. Some countries have started to incorporate the informal sector into their estimates of GDP.

Employment

For most countries, data reflect official employment records from the labour registries. In many countries, small enterprises are not recorded by official data. A number of countries have moved towards ILO-consistent labour force surveys in recording changes in labour force, employment and unemployment. Where available these data are presented.

Prices and wages

Data from the statistical offices or IMF. In some countries, notably Belarus, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan, official CPI data may underestimate underlying inflation because of price controls and inadequate measurement of price increases in informal markets. Wage data are from national authorities and often exclude small enterprises as well as the informal sector.

Government sector

Data for the general government, including local government and extra-budgetary funds, where available. Data for most countries are from IMF country reports. Budget balance data can differ from official estimates due to different budgetary accounting, in particular with respect to privatisation revenues and foreign lending.

Monetary sector

Broad money is the sum of money in circulation outside banks and demand deposits other than those of the central government. It also includes quasi-money (time, savings and foreign currency deposits of the resident sectors other than the central government). Data from IMF, International Financial Statistics, IMF country reports and monetary authorities.

Interest and exchange rates

Deposit and lending rates from most countries are weighted averages across maturities. For some countries, weighted averages are not available and rates are quoted for the most frequently used instruments. Data from the IMF, International Financial Statistics, IMF country reports and monetary authorities.

External sector

Trade data in many countries can differ between balance of payments and customs statistics, because of differences in recording and of informal border trade, which is typically not recorded by customs statistics. Trade data are on a balance of payments basis as published by the monetary authorities and in IMF country reports.